

IAN KLOSTER

Instructional Planning Samples | High School Visual Arts
+1 (913) 216-1376 | KlosterKreations@gmail.com | www.ianKloster.com

Collaborative Strategic Art Critique

Collaborative Strategic Art Critique (CSAC) Method

Duration: 1 class / On-going

Statement of Purpose:

The **Collaborative Strategic Art Critique (CSAC)** is an original instructional model I developed by adapting the research-based teaching strategy **Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR)**--a tool traditionally used to support students' comprehension and vocabulary development in content-heavy subjects such as science and social studies. CSAC applies the same principles of cooperative learning, structured roles, and scaffolded discussion to the visual arts classroom.

This method is designed for **students of any age** and can be tailored to the developmental and artistic needs of different grade levels. By breaking the complex process of art criticism into clear, manageable steps and assigning students purposeful collaborative roles, CSAC supports learners in understanding what they are looking at, using appropriate art vocabulary, and forming interpretations grounded in observable evidence.

The premise behind this approach is simple: **all students learn more effectively when they can process information together and engage in structured, meaningful dialogue.** When students slow down, describe what they notice, connect the artwork to prior knowledge, and analyze the artist's choices, they develop the ability to identify visual facts and construct sound judgments about meaning. Through this scaffolded process, students strengthen both their visual literacy and their confidence in evaluating and discussing works of art.

Overview:

- 1. Students form groups of 4-5.** Each student assumes a distinct role that corresponds to a step in the art criticism process.
- 2. Select artworks.** In this case, students use their own in-progress artworks to understand how their work is interpreted by others and to discover strategies for improving their work.
- 3. Use a visual scaffold.** Each group receives a "CSAC Guide Sheet" with:
 - Vocabulary banks for Elements & Principles of Design
 - Question stems aligned with each step of art criticism
 - Sentence starters for academic discussion (e.g., "I notice...", "I think this suggests...")
- 4. Rotate roles and artworks regularly.** After one full critique cycle, groups switch roles or artworks to ensure all students experience each stage of the process.
- 5. Reflect and Self-Evaluate.** At the end, students write and/or discuss how peer feedback will inform their next creative decision.

Standards, Vocabulary, & Concepts	<p>Priority Standards</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● RESPONDING (3) Engage in the process of art criticism to make meaning and increase visual literacy. ● RESPONDING (2) Critique personal works of art and the artwork of others, individually and collaboratively, using a variety of approaches. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> b. Develop skills and provide respectful and constructive criticism to peers as part of a community of learners. ● CREATING (6.b) Evaluate choice of media, techniques, and processes as a means to edit, revise, and modify works of art. ● CONNECTING (1.c) Analyze the ways in which personal experience affects the understanding and appreciation of works of art. <p>Key Vocabulary</p> <p>Describe, Analyze, Interpret, Evaluate Imitationalism, Formalism, Emotionalism Subject, Composition, Content Respectful, Constructive, Technical</p> <p>Key Concepts</p> <p>Feldman's 4-step Art Criticism Method 3 Major Aesthetic Theories 3 Parts of an Artwork Professional Skills</p>
Learning Objective	<p>The student will:</p> <p>Students will collaboratively analyze artworks using the Collaborative Strategic Art Critique model by assuming structured discussion roles (Art Detective, Design Analyst, Meaning Maker, Art Critic) and applying discipline-specific vocabulary to describe, analyze, interpret, and evaluate artworks. Students will demonstrate understanding through participation in group critique and by producing a self-evaluation using art vocabulary.</p>
Instructional Strategies ENGAGE Phase 1 (5-10 min)	<p>Purpose: Spark curiosity, activate prior knowledge, and introduce the need for a structured art discussion.</p> <p>Teacher will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Display compelling artwork (mysterious, emotional, complex). ● Ask quick, low-stakes warm-up questions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ “What is one thing you notice immediately?” ○ “What is one question that pops into your mind?” ● Tell students: <i>Today we will learn a way to talk about art together using special roles to help everyone contribute.</i> <p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Make quick observations. ● Share initial reactions. ● Recognize that meaningful art critique requires structure and vocabulary. <p>Materials: Projected artwork, warm-up questions, Think-Pair-Share prompt.</p>

Instructional Strategies EXPLORE Phase 2 (10-15 min)	<p>Purpose: Students experience the structure <i>before</i> receiving formal explanations.</p> <p>Teacher will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Place students in groups of 4, assign each student a CSAC role: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Art Detective (Describe) Design Analyst (Analyze) Meaning Maker (Interpret) Art Critic (Judge / Evaluate) Give each group a packet with role-specific question stems. Provide a new artwork (different from the Engage artwork). Instruct groups to work through the steps for 5-7 minutes without worrying about being perfect. <p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attempt the process using their roles. Talk through the artwork using sentence starters. Use vocabulary as best they can. <p>Materials: CSAC role cards, artwork (actual, printed, or slides), structured discussion stems.</p>
Instructional Strategies EXPLAIN Phase 3 15-20 min)	<p>Purpose: Formalize understanding of the CSAC model and the 4-step criticism process.</p> <p>Teacher will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Introduce a clear explanation of the 4 Steps of Art Criticism: <i>Describe, Analyze, Interpret, Judge</i>. Link each CSAC role to its corresponding step and clarify responsibilities. Review vocabulary banks (Elements of Art, Principles of Design, expressive vocabulary). Model a short example of each role using a new artwork. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Example: “As the Art Detective, I might say...” Allow groups to ask questions about role expectations. <p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record responsibilities in sketchbook / journal. Listen to and observe the teacher modeling each step. Ask clarifying questions. <p>Materials: Mini-lecture slide deck, vocabulary posters or slides, student sketchbooks.</p>

<p>Instructional Strategies</p> <p>ELABORATE Phase 4 (20-30 min)</p>	<p>Purpose: Apply the CSAC strategy in a deeper, more accurate, and more independent way.</p> <p>Teacher will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Give groups a final artwork or allow them to use their own artworks if the goal is peer critique. Set a timed structure for the group discussion: <p>Example Group Session Work Flow for 20-30 Minutes</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Describe (Art Detective) - 5 min - Each student contributes at least one “I notice...” statement. Analyze (Design Analyst) - 5 min The group discusses the use of Elements / Principles. Interpret (Meaning Maker) - 8 min Students brainstorm meaning and emotion. Judge (Art Critic) - 7 min Students use rubric criteria to discuss strengths and areas for growth. Wrap-up Reflection (1-2 min) Each student records one new vocabulary word and one actionable insight. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Circulate to listen for vocabulary use and depth of analysis. Prompt groups with corrective feedback as needed. <p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Apply all four steps in a more refined way. Use vocabulary intentionally. Take notes on feedback they receive that they will apply to their own artwork. <p>Materials: Artwork or student artworks, group discussion sheets, rubric language, timers.</p> <p>Additional Supporting Details:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Post Sentence Frames: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> “The artist uses ___ to create ___.” “This makes me think of ___.” “I might change ___ to improve ___.” Post Anchor Charts: Display posters of each role and its guiding questions. Gradual Release: Begin with whole-class modeling - pair discussions - then full group CSAC rounds. Rubric Connection: Tie the “Judge” step back to our classroom’s proficiency scale indicators.
--	---

Instructional Strategies EVALUATE Phase 5 (10-20 min)	<p>Purpose: Assess student learning individually and collaboratively.</p> <p>Multiple Teacher Options (Choose one or more):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-Evaluation: Students write a paragraph using art vocabulary to reflect on their own artwork using the 4 steps. • Exit Ticket: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ “What vocabulary did you use / learn today?” ◦ “What evidence helped your group interpret the artwork?” • Group Score: Quick rubric (1-4) assessing collaboration and vocabulary usage. • Peer Feedback Form: Students give written feedback to a peer based on Describe-Analyze-Interpret-Judge. <p>Students will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Show evidence of vocabulary understanding. • Write self-reflection or self-evaluation. • Complete exit ticket or speak to what they contributed in their role. <p>Materials: Rubric, self-evaluation template, exit ticket prompt.</p>
Assessment Strategies	<p>FORMATIVE</p> <p>Proximity and Anecdotal Notes: The teacher will monitor student observations to gauge prior knowledge, comfort describing visual details, and vocabulary usage. The teacher will determine how much scaffolding will be needed in each phase.</p> <p>Structured Note-taking and Discussion: During the CSAC, students will use sentence starters and role-specific questions to complete a dedicated CSAC learning log or record notes in their visual verbal journals. The teacher will briefly check notes or cold call questions to verify that students can accurately differentiate between the four steps of art criticism and understand how vocabulary connects to each stage of the critique process.</p> <p>Exit Ticket or Self-Reflection: Students will complete a short written exit ticket (ex: “What vocabulary did you use today?” “What evidence supported your group’s interpretation?”). The teacher will review these quickly for correct vocabulary, understanding the 4-steps of a CSAC art critique, and the student’s ability to use evidence-based statements.</p>